A CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF SANAVIYAH AMAH CURRICULUM OF MADRASAH IN PAKISTAN

Hameedullah Bhutto*  
Dr. Ibrahem Narongraksakhet**

DOI: 10.6084/m9.figshare.4519712
Link: https://dx.doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.4519712.v1

ABSTRACT:
Appraisal and critique over Pakistani Madrasahs is remained vide debated issue since many decades. Specially, media focused Pakistani Madrasahs at large scale after 9/11 incident. Madrasah is a private sector that provides free of cost formal education with boarding and some other facilities. This system of education is very strong and imparting sound religious knowledge to the students. Madrasahs’ curriculum is based on Dars-e-Nizami that is implemented with minor modifications and enhancement, this Curriculum mainly consists of religious sciences. Madrasahs have their own management system under five wafaqs (federations) which are linked with particular school of doctrinal orientation. These wafaqs define the curriculum, register Madrasahs and their students; conduct examinations of various levels and award certificates to the graduates. The structure of grade levels is set up parallel to the mainstream education system from primary to graduation and specialization levels. In this study, the researchers aim to analyze the Sanaviyah Amah curriculum of Madrasahs in Pakistan. Therefore, this paper is an attempt to discourse and analyze the current Sanaviyah Amah curriculum of Madrasahs in Pakistan which is implemented by five wafaqs (federations) of Madrasahs in Pakistan. Sanaviyah Amah is equivalent to the secondary level of mainstream education system. The scope of the study is to analyze the existing position of Sanaviyah Amah curriculum. The major objectives of the study are: a) to explore the philosophy, aims

* Ph.D Candidate, College of Islamic Studies, Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus, Thailand. Email: hameedullah.bhutto@usindh.edu.pk
** Associate Professor, College of Islamic Studies, Prince of Songkla University, Pattani Campus, Thailand. Email: nibrahem@bunga.pn.psu.ac.th
A Critical Analysis of Sanaviyah Amah

The exiting curriculum, b) to analyze the contents of curriculum of all wafaqs, c) to analyze the teaching methodology at Madrasah, and d) to analyze evaluation of Sanaviyah Amah in Madrasah of Pakistan. Tyler’s model is used in this study for the analysis of Madrasah curriculum in Pakistan. Finally, the findings reveal that the Sanaviyah Amah curriculum of wafaqs has some weaknesses. This paper provides an overview of five wafaqs’ curriculum and suggests the steps to follow the educational philosophy for the improvement of the curriculum.

KEYWORDS: Madrasah, Curriculum, Tyler’s theory, Integrated Curriculum and Pakistan

Introduction:

Pakistan has three types of educational systems: government, private and Madrasah (Shirazi, 2015:6-7). Government and private are known as mainstream education system, while Madrasah is known as parallel education system of religious studies to the main stream education in Pakistan. Madrasah education system provides free Islamic education. The basic purpose of Madrasah education system is to maintain and intact the establishment of Mosque and Madrasah in the Muslim society that produces human resource in terms of religious education and services (Al-Rashdi, 2007:175). This education system came into being after 1857 in the south Asia with the advent of British rule (Khalid Rahman, 2009:57, Al-Rashdi, 2007:223). The British divided the system of education into two domains, i.e. Madrasah and the secular schools; the framework and objectives of the curricula were very different of both systems (Khalid Rahman, 2009:57). In 1947, Pakistan became independent country through the partition of India. At that time both systems were not sufficient to be implemented as an individual education system of the country (Usmani, 2000: 44). Pakistan, being an ideological state, was in need for such education system that should be balanced and effective in the requirements.
of material and spiritual needs (Siddiqui, 1991: 3). Unfortunately government could not initiate such steps in shaping any educational system that might fulfil both requirements. Consequently, both educational systems go together simultaneously till to date.

Madrasahs have their own management system under five waqf (federations) in Pakistan, namely (i) Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Salafia, (ii) Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Arabiah, (iii) Tanzim-ul-Madaris Ahl Sunnat, (iv) Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al- Shiah and (v) Rabitat-ul-Madaris Al-Islamiah (Nordic, 2006:26). These waqfs are identified with a particular school of thought (Ahl-e-Hadith, Deobandi, Barelwi, Shia and Jamat Islami respectively); they affiliate their concerned Madrasahs, develop curricula, establish standards, conduct examinations and issues certificates of various levels (Ahmed Mumtaz, 2009:3).

Madrasah Curriculum

The origin of Madrasah curriculum can be traced backed to late seventeenth century when Mulla Nizamuddin Sehalvi set up a Madrasah at the Firangi Mahal, Lucknow, India. Its standardized curricula were named as Dars Nizami after his death in 1748 (Malik, 2008). It included “revealed sciences” (wahhi) and “rational sciences” (ma’qulat). The revealed sciences included study of the Quran, Hadith, Quranic commentary, and Islamic jurisprudence. The rational sciences included Arabic language/grammar to help understand the Quran, Persian language / grammar, logic, rhetoric, and philosophy that would befit prospective bureaucrats / judges (Haqqani, 2002). Even three centuries later, Dars Nizami still continues to be the standard course of most of the Madrasahs in Pakistan (Malik, 2008). The duration of the course is generally eight years.
Implementation of Tyler’s theory for analyzing curriculum of Sanaviyah Amah of wafaqs:

Tyler’s curriculum theory is applied in this study to analyze curriculum of Sanaviyah Amah of all wafaqs. His theory mainly focusing on four aspects: (i) Educational philosophy, aims, goals and objectives, (ii) Curriculum contents which act as a means of attaining these goals and objectives, (iii) Method of teaching which provides the organization of learning experiences, and (iv) Evaluation for determining learning outcomes.

Philosophy, aims, goals and objectives of Madrasah education:

Philosophy for any educational program is indispensable as it delivers a general framework for curriculum development to attain educational objectives. Tyler (2013:34) proposes use of educational philosophy as a screen for selecting and eliminating educational objectives. But the documents of wafaqs’ curriculum don’t provide clear information about any educational philosophy that illustrates the aims, goals and objectives of Madrasah education. Only Rabitat-ul-Madaris Al-Islamiah (2010:5-6) and Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Salafia (2011:4) have mentioned some aims and objectives of their wafaqs those likely seem mission statements rather than educational objectives. How is it possible that Madrasah education system is effectively operational without any educational philosophy? It means this system has some hidden philosophies that make it survive in the society. The review of literature reveals two factors to answer this question; those are mentioned earlier in the introduction. First, this education system was started in 1857 as a
movement to maintain and intact the establishment of Mosque and Madrasah in the Muslim society; then this movement became the philosophy or philosophy cum movement to continue this education system. Second, this education system is dire need of the society as it provides free religious education and social services. This basic need of society, in terms of religious education and services, makes this system alive and effective.

**Curriculum contents of all Wafaqs “Federations”:**

Curriculum content is the raw material for the students by which they are expected to meet the purpose of the education established for the curriculum (Sowel1996:154) According to Taba (1962:267-285) curriculum contents should be valid and significant, learnable and adaptable to students’ experiences, consistent with social and cultural realities, balance of breadth and depth, provide for a wide range of objectives and appropriate to the needs and interests of the students. To select the curriculum contents and text books all wafaqs have special committees comprises on subject specialists and well experienced and learned scholars.

In the past, due to the pressure of government and civil society some secular and modern subjects were integrated up to Sanaviyah Amahs in the curriculum of all wafaqs to modernize and integrate the Madrasah education system with mainstream. The researchers analyzed the Sanaviyah Amah curriculum contents of all wafaqs comparatively to find out the similarities and resemblances among their curricula and uniformity with each other. For that purpose, researchers deeply studied the curricula of all wafaqs. The results of that comparative analysis study are discussed one by one under the description of the subjects. The highest number of subjects 15 and the lowest number 12 are recorded in all five wafaqs (see
figure 1) in Sanaviyah Amah curriculum. Following subjects are implemented in five wafas:

1. **Religious Subjects**: Holy Qur’an; Tajwid (Elocution); Hadith (Apostolic Tradition); Fiqh (Jurisprudence); Aqaid (Scholasticism); Sirat (Biography of the Prophet); Ethics; Mantiq (Logic); Islamic Studies; Usul Fiqh (Principles of Jurisprudence).

2. **Languages**: Arabic Language; Arabic (Translation and conversation); Sarf (Etymology); Nahv (Syntax); Maani wa Bayan (Rhetoric); English; Urdu.

3. **Main Stream (Integrated) Subjects**: Science; Mathematics; Computer; Pakistan Studies.

**Comparative Study of curriculum contents of all wafas under the description of subjects:**

1. **The Holy Qur’an**: The translation of the Holy Qur’an is the core subject of all wafas in both years of Sanaviyah Amah. Very special attention is being paid to teach the translation of the Holy Qur’an. Tanzim-ul-Madaris Ahl Sunnat Pakistan, Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al- Shiah and Rabitat-ul-Madaris Al-Islamiah are common in the selection of chapters (from chapter one to chapter nine) for the translation of the Holy Qur’an with minor differences; albeit Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Salafia went bit ahead and selected chapters from ten to eighteen chapters. Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Arabiah is totally different from other wafas as it selected chapters from seventy eight to one hundred and fourteen chapters. However, this portion of chapters; is the part of middle level before Sanaviyah Amah of other wafas. 2. **Tajwid**: Tajwid is the science of elocution that enables students to recite the Holy Qur’an with proper accent and beautiful voice. Tajwid is
employed in the curricula of all wafaqs except Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Shiah. Text books of Tajwid are different. Only two books “Jamal Al-Qur’an” and “Fawaid Makkiah” are common between Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Arabia and Rabitat-ul-Madaris Al-Islamiah. Almost all wafaqs selected last part of the Holy Qur’an but some differences in the practice of Tajwid with memorizing the verses of the Holy Qur’an.

3. Hadith: Hadith subject is included in curriculum of all wafaqs except Tanzim-ul-Madaris Ahl Sunnat Pakistan. This subject is included in both years of Sanaviyah Amah. Text books of Hadith are different. Only one book Zad Al-Talibin is common between Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Arabia and Rabitat-ul-Madaris Al-Islamiah. And, Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Salafia has an additional book of subject Usul Hadith “Risalah Usul Hadith by Muhammad Awais Bilgirami Nadvi” in the second year. 4. Fiqh: Fiqh subject is the part of all wafaqs except Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Salafia. This subject is included in both years of Sanaviyah Amah of all wafaqs except Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Arabia, it added this subject in one year only. Texts books of Fiqh are different in each wafq; only Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Arabia and Rabitat-ul-Madaris Al-Islamiah have same book “Quduri” but differ in teaching method; the book is entitled for one year in the curriculum of Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Arabia, while it is divided in two portions for two years in the curriculum of Rabitat-ul-Madaris Al-Islamiah.

5. Aqaid: Aqaid subject is part of only three wafaqs, namely Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Salafia, Tanzim-ul-Madaris Ahl Sunnat and Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Shiah with different text books. Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Salafia and Tanzim-ul-Madaris Ahl Sunnat allocated this subject for one year, while Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Shiah allocated it for two years. 6. Sirat: Sirat subject is incorporated in only curriculum of Wafaq-ul-
Madaris Al-Salafia and Rabitat-ul-Madaris Al-Islamiah but they are
different in text books and years. 7. Ethics: Ethics subject is employed in
the curriculum only by Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al- Shiah for both years in
Sanaviyah Amah.

8. Mantiq: All wafaqs encompassed Mantiq subject in their
curricula except Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Salafia. Mantiq is included in the
curriculum of Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al- Shiah for two years, while rest of
wafaqs included it for one year in their curriculum. The text books are
different in each wafaq; only Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Arabiah and Rabitat-
ul-Madaris Al-Islamiah are common to “Taisir Al-Mantiq” and “Mirqat”.

9. Islamic Studies: In the main stream curriculum, Islamic studies, is a
compulsory subject to impart the religious education among the students
of main stream education system. Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Arabiah is the
only one wthat integrated this subject from main stream curriculum. 10.
Usul al-Fiqh: Usul Fiqh subject is added in curriculum of Sanaviyah
Amah only by Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al- Shiah for one year. 11. Arabic:
Arabic subject is an integral part of curricula of all wafaqs and contained
in both years of Sanaviyah Amah. Each wafaq is different from each other
in terms of text books; although Tanzim-ul-Madaris Ahl Sunnat and
Rabitat-ul-Madaris Al-Islamiah are common in text book “Tariqah
Jadidah”.

12. Sarf: Sarf subject is included in curricula of all wafaq except
Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al- Shiah. Sarf is included in both years of Sanaviyah
Amah. There is variety of text books but “Ilm Al- Sarf (Akhirain)”,
“Mizan Al-Sarf”, “Manshiab”, “Ilm Al-Sighah” and “Fusul Akbari” are
the most common text books among them. 13. Nahv: Nahv subject is the
part of all wafaqs’ curricula and included in both years of Sanaviyah
Amah. With different varieties of text books “Ilm Al-Nahv”, “Sharh Miata
Amil”, “Hidayat Al-Nahv” and “Nahv Mir” are most common among them. **14. Maani wa Bayan:** Maani wa Bayan subject is part of curricula of all wafaq except Tanzim-ul-Madaris Ahl Sunnat. Maani wa Bayan subject is included in the curriculum of all wafaq for one year. The text books are different; only Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Arabia and Rabitat-ul-Madaris Al-Islamiah are common in text book “Mualim Al-Insha”.

**15. English:** Due to the importance of English language in the modern age, this subject is integrated from the curriculum of main stream education system. Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Arabia and Tanzim-ul-Madaris Ahl Sunnat have included this subject for one year, while Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Salafia and Rabitat-ul-Madaris Al-Islamiah included it for two years in their curriculum. English subject is not included in the curriculum of Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Shia. As far as the text books are concerned every wafaq has adopted different text book. For example Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Salafia refers to Punjab Text Book Board, Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Arabia mentions as “suggested by the government”, Tanzim-ul-Madaris Ahl Sunnat has printed its own text book according to the main stream curriculum and Rabitat-ul-Madaris Al-Islamiah suggests concerned (provincial) Text Book Board. **16. Urdu:** Urdu is a national language of Pakistan and is the part of main stream curriculum as a compulsory subject of Sanaviyah Amah. Only Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Arabia and Rabitat-ul-Madaris Al-Islamiah have integrated Urdu subject in their curricula; Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Arabia included it for one year while, Rabitat-ul-Madaris Al-Islamiah for two years.

**17. Science:** Science subject is also integrated from the main stream curriculum to impart the basic knowledge of science among the students of Madrasah. Only Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Salafia, Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Arabia and Tanzim-ul-Madaris Ahl Sunnat have added this
subject in their curriculum. Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Salafia has included it for two years and suggested Punjab Text Book Board. Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Arabiah included it for one year and suggested text book according to the government policy. Tanzim-ul-Madaris Ahl Sunnat has printed its own text book according to the main stream curriculum and included this subject for one year. **18. Mathematics:** Mathematics subject is integrated from the curriculum of main stream education system. Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Salafia and Rabitat-ul-Madaris Al-Islamiah have added this subject for two years, while Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Arabiah and Tanzim-ul-Madaris Ahl Sunnat included it for one year in their curriculum. Mathematics is not included in the curriculum of Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Shiah. As far as the text books are concerned every wafaq has adopted different text books. For example Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Salafia refers to Punjab Text Book Board; Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Arabiah mentions as “suggested by the government”. Tanzim-ul-Madaris Ahl Sunnat has printed its own text book according to the main stream curriculum, and Rabitat-ul-Madaris Al-Islamiah suggests concerned (provincial) Text Book Board. **19. Computer:** Only Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Salafia integrated Computer subject as an optional subject and included it for both years of Sanaviyah Amah. Text book of computer is referred to Punjab Text Book Board. **20. Pakistan Study:** As Pakistan is an ideological state, Pakistan study is the compulsory subject of main stream curriculum to make the students more ideological nation. To follow the government’s educational policy, all *wafas* incorporated Pakistan study subject in their curricula except Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Shiah. All wafas included this subject for one year except Rabitat-ul-Madaris Al-Islamiah that included it for two years. For the text book of Pakistan study, Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Salafia refers to Punjab Text Book Board, Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Arabiah
mentions as “suggested by the government”; Tanzim-ul-Madaris Ahl Sunnat has printed its own text book according to the main stream curriculum, and Rabitat-ul-Madaris Al-Islamiah suggests concerned (provincial) Text Book Board.

Figure 1: Shows Analytical Assessment of the Subjects in Concerned Wafaq.
After the comparative study of curricula of all wafas, it shows that they are almost common in terms of selecting subjects with some differences in their curricula, but they are not common in the selection of text books, and the structure of the curriculum is also different from each other. Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Arabiah is unique and individual for making Sanaviyah Amah in three years. Because of the demand of government and stakeholders, all wafas integrated some subjects from mainstream into their curricula except Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Shiah. Text books are not unified. Every wafaq suggests different text books; only Tanzim-ul-Madaris prepared its own text books according to the government policy. Rabitat-ul-Madaris Al-Islamia has included “Pakistan” and “Urdu” subjects in its curriculum for two years, unlike in mainstream’s curriculum. Therefore, there is no classification of compulsory or optional subjects in the curricula of all wafas except Wafaq-ul-Madaris Al-Salafia that has maintained religious
subjects as compulsory and integrated subjects of main stream as optional subjects. Rabitat-ul-Madaris Al-Islamiah suggests some extra books to the students apart from the curriculum to develop the habit of self-study.

**Method of teaching:**

Teaching students or imparting knowledge to the learners actually is organizing of curriculum contest in the best way. The success of any curriculum depends on effective teaching methodology to attain the objectives. As Taba (1962:290) stated sometimes curriculum is ineffective not because its curriculum is inadequate but because it is put together in a way that makes learning difficult or less effective and less productive.

The teaching methodology in *Madrasahs* is old and traditional. Khalid (2008:39) shares his observations that teaching methodology in *Madrasahs* is still in a traditional way except some *Jamia’at* (*Madrasahs* who provides graduation level education). Here traditional way means teacher reads the content of text book and explains the textual meaning to the students where hardly ten percent of students participate in this method who listen the teacher (Nadvi. n.d: 88). The whole curriculum of *Madrasahs* is confined to book oriented only. Objectives and teaching methodology are not mentioned anywhere in the curriculum (Khalid S.M. 2004:266). Also, there is no formal or informal system available for teachers’ training in *Madrasahs* for effective teaching (Khalid S.M. 2004:337).

Due to the ineffective teaching and passive method of imparting knowledge, students cannot participate in active learning process. This affects students’ abilities and their critical and creative thinking, but it also leads towards narrow-mindedness.
Evaluation:

Evaluation plays a significant role in the curriculum development. It not only identifies the strengths and weaknesses of the curriculum, but it also helps to find out the desired goals and results of proposed curriculum. According to the Tyler (2013:105-106) evaluation is the process of determining to what extent the educational objectives are being realized by the curriculum. Saylor et. al. (1981:316) describe evaluation as a process used in judging the appropriateness of curriculum choices. However, evaluation is defined in various ways with association of various aspects in the subject of curriculum. Following the Tyler’s theory, evolution must appraise the behavior of the students, and it also must be more than one time to check the behavioral changes in the students (Tyler 2013: 106). This evaluation can be conducted at the beginning and at the end of any educational program to measure the behavioral changes in the students. Evaluation process can be assessed by paper and pencil devices, questionnaires, interviews, observations, and records.

Before the establishment of wafaqs, there was no any formal system for evaluation process in Madrasah education. The scholars’ written permission was provided to the pupils allowing them to teach anywhere and any person. The permission was based on the scholars’ observation and considered as a certificate and degree that was accepted in the society. After establishment of wafaqs, the modern evaluation was implemented through examination system. Parcha (1993:160) expressed his views that since Madrasahs have initiated central examination system that resulted remarkable increase in the standard of Madrasah education. Moreover, the evaluation system of wafaqs is confined to students’ assessment through paper and pencil devices, observations, and
interviews. All wafqa修身 conduct the Sanaviyah Amah examination of their affiliated Madrasahs once at the end of second year.

Major Findings:

Strengths of the Curriculum of Sanaviyah Amah:

- Curriculum contents are valid and significant.
- Curriculum contents are learnable and adaptable to students’ experiences.
- Curriculum contents are balance of breadth and depth.
- Curriculum contents can provide for a wide range of objectives.
- Curriculum contents are consistent with social and cultural realities.
- Curriculum contents are appropriate to the needs and interests of the students.
- Curriculum contents and text books selected through committees comprises on subject specialists and well experienced scholars.
- Curriculum contents are integrated with some secular and modern subjects were to modernize and integrate the Madrasah education system with mainstream.
- Students become able to translate the verses of Holy Quran in their mother tongue and explain in own words.
- Students become able to recite the Holy Quran with proper accent and beautiful voice.
- Students’ memory becomes stronger by memorizing some chapters from the Holy Quran and Hadith.
- Students become able to translate Hadith in their mother tongue and explain in own words.
Students learn two foreign languages, i.e. Arabic and English.

Students get their education free of cost.

Students get sound knowledge about religion and faith.

The evaluation of students’ behavior is assessed through paper and pencil devices, observations, and interviews (oral examination).

Weaknesses of the Curriculum of Sanaviyah Amah:

- There is no clear educational philosophy for Madrasah education.
- Aims, goals and objectives of Sanaviyah Amah Madrasah education are not formulated and set.
- Some curriculum contents of Fiqh subjects are not valid and outdated.
- Lack of curriculum contents of modern Fiqh in Fiqh subject.
- Curriculum contents of Mantiq subject are not learnable and adaptable to students’ experiences at Sanaviyah Amah.
- Curriculum contents of Maani wa Bayan subject are not learnable and adaptable to students’ experiences at Sanaviyah Amah.
- Curriculum contents of Usul Fiqh subject are not learnable and adaptable to students’ experiences at Sanaviyah Amah.
- Unnecessary consideration towards Sarf and Nahv subject is paid at large scale.
- The teaching methodology is old and traditional.
- Ineffective teaching and passive method of imparting knowledge.
- Students cannot participate in active learning process due to poor teaching methodology.
- Traditional teaching methodology affects students’ abilities and their critical and creative thinking.
Conclusions

In conclusion, literature review and analysis reveal that there is no clear educational philosophy found in the curriculum of wafas that can select and eliminate goals and objectives of Madrasah education. The curriculums of all wafas need an educational philosophy to select the educational goals, objectives and standards.

Curriculum contents are valid, learnable and consistent with needs of society and students. Curriculum contents are integrated with modern subjects to modernize and integrate the Madrasah education system with mainstream. Moreover, adequate guidelines and teacher training are not ensured in the curriculum; consequently, teachers are not able to refine the curriculum according to their particular needs and needs of their students.

Furthermore, the evaluation system of wafas is confined to students’ assessment only through examination system, but evaluation system to identify weaknesses of existing curriculum; teachers’ delivery and policy formulation do not functionally exist at any waifaq. Finally, study suggests that all wafas should prepare a specific educational program with a well-structured curriculum that describes the clear educational philosophy, goals, objectives, learning experiences and evaluation. The educational program of all wafas should be valid educationally and accepted by teachers, students, parents and the society.

REFERENCES


